

25th
Anniversary
Edition

LOUISIANA

SAPPHIRE

With a New Preface
by TAYARI JONES and
a New Afterword
by the Author

A NOVEL

September 26, 2025

Gary Adams
397 Via Promesa
Nipomo, CA 93444
Email: adams5365@gmail.com
Phone: 650-245-8512

Paul Fawcett, EdD, Superintendent
Lucia Mar Unified School District
602 Orchard Street
Arroyo Grande, CA 93420

Subject: Appeal to the Board of Trustees regarding the Library Review Committee Decision of *Push* by Sapphire

Dear Dr. Fawcett,

This letter is to formally **appeal the decision of the Library Review Committee** regarding the inclusion of *Push* by Sapphire in the Arroyo Grande High School library. I respectfully request that the Board determine whether this book conforms to the principles and criteria set forth in district policy, community standards, and constitutional and legal standards.

1. AR 6163.1 Criteria

Lucia Mar USD's AR 6163.1 basically conforms to that of most other schools, in that it specifies that library resources should:

- "support, enrich, and assist in implementing the educational program" and "contributing to the curriculum and educational goals"
- be appropriate to the age, social and emotional development and learning styles of students
- have literary merit as determined by others through their reviews and recommendations, reputation of author, etc.
- provide a balance of viewpoints, but without presenting material in a manner which is prurient, vulgar, or inappropriate for the intended student audience

It is my concern that *Push* fails to meet several of these standards. Its **graphic sexual content, depictions of incest, and violent themes** raise serious questions about suitability for the emotional and social developmental stage of students who have access to it, its appropriateness for these students, its ability to enrich the curriculum, or its alignment with other District standards.

2. Constitutional and Legal Standards

The U.S. Supreme Court has also recognized limits on school library materials:

- In *Miller v. California* (1973), the Court found that library materials that "the average person, applying contemporary community standards" would find appeals to "*prurient interest*" and lacks serious literary or educational value could be removed.

Page 2.

Paul Fawcett, September 26, 2025

Appeal re: *Push*

- In *Bethel School District v. Fraser* (1986), the Court affirmed that schools may restrict “*vulgar, lewd, and indecent*” speech in the interest of protecting minors and maintaining a safe educational environment. The majority opinion written by Justice Burger also
- went on to acknowledge “that the school board has the authority to remove books that are vulgar.”
- In *Board of Education v. Pico* (1982), a plurality held that school boards may not remove books merely for ideological reasons, but may remove those that are “*pervasively vulgar*” or *educationally unsuitable*.

Taken together, these rulings support the district’s authority — and responsibility — to evaluate whether a book like *Push* crosses the line from literary value into vulgarity or prurient appeal inconsistent with educational purposes.

3. Request for Review

In light of AR 6163.1 and relevant Supreme Court decisions regarding limits on the First Amendment for materials presented to students, I respectfully ask the Board to:

- Reconsider whether *Push* is *age-appropriate* for students with access to the school library.
- Determine whether its content meets the criteria of *contributing to the curriculum, possessing literary merit, and being suitable for the intended grade level*.
- Evaluate whether the book’s graphic nature renders it “*pervasively vulgar*” or appealing to the “*prurient interest*,” making it inconsistent with both district policy and constitutional standards.

I appreciate your commitment to ensuring that library materials reflect both the educational mission of our schools and the standards set forth in AR 6163.1 and relevant Supreme Court decisions. Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

Gary Adams

Gary Adams

cc: Colleen Martin <Colleen.Martin@lmusd.org>
Don Stewart <Don.R.Stewart@lmusd.org>
Donna Kandel <Donna.Kandel@lmusd.org>
Dee Santos <Dee.Santos@lmusd.org>
Andrea Naemi-Vergne - <Andrea.Naemi-Vergne@lmusd.org>
Mike Fuller <Mike.Fuller@lmusd.org>
Eileen Pham - <Eileen.Pham@lmusd.org>
Hillery Dixon <Hillery.Dixon@lmusd.org>
Raquel Lujano <Raquel.Lujano@lmusd.org>

October 8, 2025

Gary Adams
397 Via Promesa
Nipomo, CA 93444
adams5365@gmail.com
650-245-8512

Board of Trustees
Lucia Mar Unified School District
602 Orchard Street
Arroyo Grande, CA 93420

Re: Legal and Educational Basis for Restricting or Removing Push

I. Issue

The issue at hand is whether the novel *Push* by Sapphire contains content that may lawfully be restricted or removed from a public-school library on the grounds that it is harmful or unsuitable for minors based educational suitability, age appropriateness, and student welfare.

II. Thesis

Push contains frequent depictions of sexual abuse, violence, and mature themes, often described in graphic language and repeated throughout the narrative. While the book has been adjudicated as not obscene for adults, the material may be considered unsuitable for minors in a general school library setting due to its focus on repeated sexual trauma, profanity, and other adult themes. Courts and state law allow schools to restrict access to material that is harmful or inappropriate for minors, provided the decision is viewpoint neutral.

In addition to explicit sexual content, the book uses intentionally phonetic spelling and non-standard grammar consistently, which diverges sharply from standard written English typically required in instructional materials.

III. Background and Evidence

Push is a novel centered on a teenage girl who experiences repeated sexual abuse by her father and mother, resulting in multiple pregnancies and severe trauma. The book contains frequent and graphic descriptions of sexual acts between adults and a minor — including oral, vaginal, and anal intercourse — rendered in explicit and vulgar anatomical terms. Multiple passages describe sexual stimulation, coercion, incestuous acts, and self-harm. These depictions are not incidental to the plot but occur repeatedly throughout the narrative and are not age-appropriate for high school minors in an unmediated setting. (Some quotations are contained in the Appendix)

III. Relevant Law

A. Federal Law

1. **Roth v. United States (1957)** — Established that obscenity is not protected by the First Amendment and ties the definition of obscenity to *community standards*.
2. **Miller v. California (1973)** Refined the legal definition of obscenity by structuring a three-part test: (i) appeals to prurient interest, (ii) depicts sexual conduct in a patently

offensive way, and (iii) lacks serious literary, artistic, political, or scientific value (LAPS). The guidelines enumerate "appeal to prurient interest" be based on *contemporary community standards*." Depicting "sexual conduct in an offensive way" is based on applicable state law. The courts' definition of *community* is flexible, however, and can be either statewide or confined to a defined community.

3. **Ginsberg v. New York (1968)** Permits restrictions on material considered harmful to minors, even if it is legal for adults based on each state's compelling interest in protecting children's welfare. *Ginsberg* lays the groundwork for cases involving school libraries, public displays, and regulation of indecent materials for minors. While *Push* has culturally recognized literary and artistic value for adults, *Ginsberg* allows for consideration based on *content* suitability for *minors*.
4. **Board of Education v. Pico (1982)** School boards cannot remove books solely to suppress ideas but may restrict materials based on *content* such as that which is **educationally unsuitable, has potential for student harm, or is age inappropriate**, provided the decision is content-based and viewpoint-neutral. Removing a library book is unconstitutional if it is motivated by disagreement with ideas, but not content.

B. California Law

1. Harmful Matter to Minors – Cal. Penal Code § 313

Defines "harmful matter" similarly to *Miller* and *Ginsberg*: material that appeals to prurient interest, is patently offensive by statewide standards, and lacks serious value — but applies these standards to minors — thereby the code allows restricting distribution of material that may otherwise be legal for adults.

2. California Education Code § 60045

Requires instructional materials to be accurate, objective, age-appropriate, and use proper grammar and spelling. Though primarily directed to instructional materials, districts commonly apply similar standards to library acquisitions.

IV. Analysis

A. Federal Law Application to *Push*

Under *Ginsberg*, material that is lawful for adults can still be restricted to minors if harmful. *Push* includes pervasive, explicit depictions of incestuous sexual abuse and vulgar language. These depictions are graphic and repeated, fitting within categories described by *Miller* as patently offensive sexual conduct which can be regulated by the state.

While some critics attribute literary value to this work for adults, the relevant legal inquiry concerns its value for minors, which may be different given the content's explicit nature and lack of educational framing.

Under *Pico*, removal or restriction is permissible when based on legitimate pedagogical concerns such as age appropriateness, not viewpoint discrimination. Here the basis would be the graphic sexual content and trauma, and its potential harmful impact on minors.

B. California Law Application

Penal Code § 313 permits restricting material harmful to minors. The book's explicit descriptions of sexual and physical abuse, incest, vulgarity and trauma arguably meet this definition.

The use of non-standard grammar and spelling also conflicts with Education Code § 60045, supporting a finding that the book is educationally unsuitable.

V. Summary

1. **Content Unsuitability** – *Push* contains **pervasive sexual abuse** and **trauma** as central elements of the narrative. The recurrent depictions of violence, sexual exploitation, and profanity suggest the book may **pose risks to minors' psychological welfare**, particularly for students who may have experienced similar trauma.
2. **Harm to Minors** – Although the novel may have **literary or artistic value for adults**, under *Ginsberg*, the relevant inquiry is whether the work is **suitable for minors**, not whether it is appropriate for adult readers. If not suitable for minors, it is considered "harmful matter" California Penal Code § 313.
3. **Educational suitability** - The repeated focus on sexual trauma differentiates the work from materials containing isolated mature themes used for educational purposes.
4. **Viewpoint Neutrality** – Restrictions are based on age appropriateness, educational suitability and student welfare, not suppression of ideas. Removal aligns with *Pico's* allowance for content-neutral, pedagogically justified decisions.
5. **Educational Considerations** – The book's persistent nonstandard spelling and vulgar language violate California Education Code § 60045, providing an additional educational justification for restricted access.

Under *Pico*, the board may restrict access to *Push* based on **age appropriateness, educational unsuitability** and **potential for harm to minors**, provided the decision is content based and viewpoint neutral. Restrictions could include:

- Removal from general library circulation
- Restricted access with parental permission

Both options align with federal and state law.

Sincerely,

Gary Adams

Gary Adams

cc: Paul Fawcett <paul.fawcett@lmusd.org>
Raquel Lujano <raquel.lujano@lmusd.org>

Appendix attached

APPENDIX:

WARNING – THE CONTENT INCLUDED IS VERY GRAPHIC

1. **Evidence:** Representative quotations from *Push* containing vulgarity, slang, profanity, and graphic descriptions of incestuous sexual activity with resultant pregnancies making it unsuitable for the emotional and cognitive maturity of minors:

Page 3 (paragraphs 1 and 2) - *Daughter/narrator is suspended then expelled because she was pregnant and had a baby, a product of incest by her father/Carl, at the age of 12.*

"I was left back when I was twelve because I had a baby for my fahver. That was 1983. I was out of school for a year. This is gonna be my second baby....I got suspended from school 'cause I'm pregnant which I don't think is fair."

Page 6 (paragraphs 1 and 11) - *Daughter/narrator is in Mrs. Lichenstein's office (principal?) when she appears pregnant and Mrs. Lichtenstein asks her age.*

"White cunt box [referring to Mrs. Lichenstein] got my file on her desk...she look at me like I said I wanna suck a dog's dick or some shit." [underlining mine]

Page 9 (paragraph 3 and 5) - *The daughter/narrator is standing at the sink washing dishes when her mother notices she's pregnant, mother's response.*

"...She been staring at my stomach. I know what's coming. I don't wanna stand here 'n hear Mom call me a slut... Slut! Nasty ass tramp!... I was standing at this sink the last time I was pregnant when them pains hit, wump!...I jus' standing there 'n pain hits me, then pain go sit down, then pain git up 'n hit me harder! 'N she standing there screaming at me, 'Slut! Goddam slut! You fuckin' cow! I don't believe this, right under my nose....Pain hit me again, then she hit me. I'm on the floor groaning, 'Mommy please, Mommy please, please Mommy! Mommy! Mommy! MOMMY!' Then she KICK me side of my face! 'Whore! Whore!' she screamin'." [underlining mine]

Page 12 (top of page) - *The daughter/narrator knows how she got pregnant.*

"...knowing a man put his dick in you, gush white stuff in your booty you could get pregnant. I'm twelve now, I been knowing about that since I was five or six, maybe I always known about pussy and dick." [underlining mine]

Page 18 (paragraph 1) - *The daughter/narrator remembers when she was in first grade and her father made her give him oral sex and possibly vaginal sex.*

"Daddy put his pee-pee smelling thing in my mouth, my pussy, but never hold me. I see me, first grade, pink dress dirty sperm stuffs on it. No one comb my hair."

[underlining mine]

Page 19 (paragraph 1 and 2) - *Mother beats daughter about three months after the birth of her first baby, product of incest with father; mother is collecting welfare for the baby who is living with the grandmother.*

"I'm still twelve when all this happen, Mama slap me. HARD. Then she pick up cast-iron skillet, thank god it was no hot grease in it, and she hit me so hard on back I fall on

floor. Then she kick me in ribs. Then she say, 'Thank you Miz Claireece Precious Jones for fucking my husband you nasty little slut!' I feel like I'm gonna die, can't breathe, from where I have baby start to hurt. 'Fat cunt bucket slut! Nigger pig bitch! He done quit me! He done left me 'cause of you. What you tell them mutherfuckers at the damn hospital? I should KILL you!" she screaming at me." [underlining mine]

Page 21 (paragraph 1) - *Mother masturbates while sexually abusing daughter.*

"I feel Mama's hand between my legs, moving up my thigh. Her hand stop, she getting ready to pinch me if I move. I just lay still still, keep my eyes close. I can tell Mama's other hand between her legs now 'cause the smell fill room. Mama can't fit into bathtub no more. Go sleep, go sleep, go to *sleep*, I tells myself. Mama's hand creepy spider, up my legs, in my pussy." [underlining mine]

Page 24 (paragraph 1 and 2) - *Mother brings father to have sex with daughter, father often has sex with daughter, daughter thinks that her mother approves of this so the father will have sex with the mother, daughter is beaten if she doesn't assent to sex with her father, daughter begins to enjoy the physical stimulation but she feels ashamed, discusses vaginal leakage after sex.*

"This time I know Mama know. Umm hmmm, she know. She bring him to me. I ain' crazy, that stinky hoe give me to him. Probably thas' what he require to fuck her, some of me. Got to where he jus' come in my room any ole time, not jus' night. He climb on me. Shut up! He say. He slap my ass, You wide as the Mississippi, don't tell me a little bit of dick hurt you heifer. Git usta it, he laff, you *is* usta it. I fall back on bed, he fall right on top of me..... I wanna scream, Oh shut up! Nigger, how you gonna marry me and you is my daddy. I'm your daughter, fucking me illegal. But I keep my mouf shut so's the fucking don't turn into a beating. I start to feel good; stop being a video dancer and start coming. I try to go back to video but coming now, rocking under Carl now, my twat jumping juicy, it feel good. I feel shamed. 'See, see,' he slap my thigh like cowboys do horses on TV, then he squeeze my nipples, bite down on it. I come some more. 'See you LIKE it! You jus' like your mama — you die for it!' He pull his dick out, the white cum stuff pour out my hole wet up the sheets." [underlining mine]

And it continues like this with references to frequent, sometimes daily, sex with father/Carl and physical abuse. Reports she is no longer a virgin by 7 (page 39).

Page 57 (paragraph 4) **and 58** (top of page) - *Daughter is pregnant; discusses ejaculate on father's penis who asks her to lick it; she begins to feel good at being physically stimulated or anticipating it which is confusing and she hates herself for feeling good.*

"I try to forget I got baby in me. I hated borning the first one. No fun. Hurt. Now again. I think my daddy. He stink, the white shit drip off his dick. Lick it, lick it. I HATE that. But then I feel the hot sauce hot cha cha feeling when he be fucking me. I get so confuse. I HATE him. But my pussy be popping. He say that, 'Big Mama your pussy is popping!' I HATE myself when I feel good." [underlining mine]

Page 59 (top of page) - *Daughter (Precious) walks into mother's room, things seem different, daughter forced into oral sex with her mother, mother asks her to suck and lick her, mother holds her down, daughter feels like killing mother.*

"I walk to my muver's room but it look different, she look different. I look like little baby almost. She is talkin' sweet to me like sometimes Daddy talks. I am choking between her legs A HUH A HUH. She is smelling big women smell. She say suck it, lick me Precious. Her hand is like a mountain pushing my head down. I squeeze my eyes shut but choking don't stop, it get worse. Then I open my eyes and look. I look at little Precious and big Mama and feel hit feeling, feel like killing Mama. But I don't....."

Page 63 (paragraph 3) - *Sexual abuse of daughter/Precious includes anal sex.*

"I'm so busy getting beat, cooking, cleaning, pussy and asshole either hurting or popping." [underlining mine]

Page 111 (paragraph 1-3) - *Daughter becomes sexually stimulated when she thinks/has sex with her father but it disgusts her and makes her nauseous, father slaps/calls daughter names while having sex with her, he bites her and she screams when he comes, daughter has an orgasm, father tells daughter she loves having sex with him but she doesn't want to say that, father sucks on daughter's nipple, daughter goes into bathroom and smears feces on her face which feels good.*

"My clit swell up I think Daddy. Daddy sick me, *disgust* me, but still he sex me up. I nawshus in my stomach but hot tight in my twat and I think I want it back, the smell of the bedroom, the hurt — he slap my face till it sting and my ears sing separate songs from each other, call me names, pump my pussy in out in out in out awww I come. He bite me *hard*. A HUMP! He slam his hips into me HARD. I scream pain he come. He slap my thighs like cowboys do horses on TV. Shiver. Orgasm in me, his body shaking, grab me, call me Fat Mama, Big Hole! You LOVE it! Say you love it! I wanna say I DON'T. I wanna say I'm a chile. But my pussy popping like grease in frying pan. He slams me again. His dick soft. He start sucking on my tittie.... Then my body take me over again, like shocks after earthquake, shiver me, I come gain. My body not mine, I hate it coming. Afterward I go bafroom, I smear shit on my face. Feel good. Don't know why but it do." [underlining mine]

Page 113 (top of page), *Precious describes cutting herself.*

"Get Daddy's razor out cabinet. Cut cut cut arm wrist, not trying to die, trying to plug myself back in"

Page 135 (paragraph 5), **page 136** (top of page) - *Narrator/Precious's mother talks about how she had her husband/Carl on one side of her and him on the other when he started to sexually abuse the baby narrator/Precious.*

"I bottle her, tittie him. Bottle more better for kids, Sanitary. But I never git dried up 'cause Carl always on me. It's like that you know. Chile, man — a woman got bofe. What you gonna do? So we in bed. I put her on one side of me on pillow. Carl on the other side me.... Carl got my tittie in his mouf. Nuffin' wrong wif that, it's natural. But I think thas the day IT start. I don't never remember nothing before that. I hot. He sucking my tittie. My eyes closed. I know he getting hard I can see wifout my eyes, I love him so much.' Umm hmm, I was raised by a psycho maniac fool. 'He climb on me, you know. You unnerstand?' No, tell us more stupid bitch. 'So he on me. Then he reach over to Precious! Start wif his finger between her legs. I say Carl what you doing! He say shut your big ass up! This is good for her. Then he git off me, take off her Pampers and try to stick his thing in Precious. You know what trip me out is it can

almost go in Precious! I think she some kinda freak baby then. I say stop Carl stop! I want him on *me*! I never want him to hurt her. I didn't want him doing *anything* to her. I wanted my man for myself. Sex me up, not my chile. So you can't blame all that shit happens to Precious on *me*. I love Carl, I love him. He her daddy, but he was my man!"

It continues on in this vein.

BOOK REVIEW COMMITTEE - BOOKS UNDER REVIEW

District	Push (Sapphire)	All Boys Aren't Blue (Johnson)	Gender Queer (Kobabe)
Lucia Mar	Purchased 2019, 0 circ		
Atascadero	Not owned		
Paso Robles	Not owned		
SLOHS	Not owned		

This report summarizes ownership, purchase dates, and circulation counts for the books under review — *Push* — across local districts.

0 circ = checked out 0 times.

Book Review Committee Meeting,
September 4, 2025

Committee Members:

-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-

Review of Materials:

- *Push*, by Sapphire

Prior to the review committee, each committee member was provided with a copy of the book(s) to be reviewed. Each member read the selection, in its entirety.

Discussion around the selection included local board policies and administrative regulations, as well as other relevant book selection criteria, such as Titlewave, review journals, and individual school library policies and procedures.

After review and discussion, the committee recommends that the book *Push*, by Sapphire, remain in the high school libraries for circulation. The book should be available for check out for all students in grades 9-12. This decision results in NO ACTION, effectively returning the book to general circulation just as before.

The committee reviewed and discussed the selection as a whole, and came to the conclusion that this selection is appropriate for a high school library, and should be available for students in grades 9-12. After discussion, there were no further concerns about this selection.



Book Review Committee Meeting
September 4, 2025

Agenda/Introductions

Committee Members:

-
-
-
-
-
-
-
-

Norms:

- ☺ Manage distractions appropriately so that we can stay focused on the work.
- ☺ Be open minded and respect the ideas of all members of the team.
- ☺ Start and end on time.
- ☺ Listen attentively and seek to understand prior to action.

Additional Information:

- Expert Review of materials
- Circulation Report

Review of Materials:

- 10:00- Complainant #1- Gary Adams **Book:** *Push*, by Sapphire
-
-

In Reviewing Materials, The Review Committee Shall:

- Bear in mind the principles of the freedom to learn and read
- Examine the challenged resource
- Provide an opportunity for appropriate persons to address the committee, including the individuals(s) expressing the concern and staff using the resource
- Determine general acceptance of the resource by consulting standard evaluation aids and local holdings in other schools
- Weigh values and faults and form opinions based on the material as a whole rather than on passages or sections taken out of context
- Discuss the challenged resource in the context of the educational program
- Reach a decision about the continued use of the resource and prepare a written report



- A major criterion for the final decision is the appropriateness of the material for its intended use.
- Although not directly applicable, members may wish to consider other existing content rating systems designed to protect children from inappropriate content (e.g., MPAA film ratings, ESRB video game ratings, TV Parental Guidelines). Also, consider what might be viewed as "obscene" or "vulgar" content that would warrant corrective disciplinary action for a student.
- A challenge to a title may result in access to it being retained, restricted, or withdrawn entirely. Restrictions on access may include relocating the book to a section of the library intended for an older age group than the book is intended for, labeling it with a content warning or rating, taking it out of the online catalog so it has to be requested from a staff member, removing it from open and freely browsable stacks, or requiring parental permission to check it out.

Resources:

[AR 6163.1: Library Media Centers](#)



Library Book Selection Criteria

Review of: Push, by Sapphire

Please note any areas of concern for possible conversation. If the criteria is not applicable (from your perspective) note n/a

	No Concern	Concern	Comments
Alignment with District and State standards	/		
Contribution to the curriculum and educational goals	/		
Relevance to the varied interest of the students	/		
Favorable reviews found in standard selection sources	/		
Favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel	/		
Readability	/		
Reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher	/		
Validity, currency, and appropriateness of material	/		
Contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues	/	no	
High degree of potential user appeal	no	It's hard to find an audience	mention the movie
Artistic quality and literacy style	/		
Quality, durability, and variety of format	/		
Value commensurate with cost and/or need	/		



Resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as electronic and multimedia (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies).	✓		
Provide a global perspective and promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures.	✓		

Additional Notes:

Library Book Selection Criteria

Review of: Push, by Sapphire

Please note any areas of concern for possible conversation. If the criteria is not applicable (from your perspective) note n/a

	No Concern	Concern	Comments
Alignment with District and State standards	✓		Global perspective, not myopic
Contribution to the curriculum and educational goals	✓		Shows the struggles of minority poor and people pushed through the education system
Relevance to the varied interest of the students	✓		Teaching girls ^{to not} accept sexual assault by a grown man is ok. Display graphic for girls to recognize it.
Favorable reviews found in standard selection sources	✓		
Favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel	✓		
Readability	✓		
Reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher	✓		
Validity, currency, and appropriateness of material	✓		
Contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues		✓	My concern is with the availability of successful black stereotypes. Are there other books that depict black people who make it out of poverty?
High degree of potential user appeal		✓	I would like to try to understand why the
Artistic quality and literacy style		✓	
Quality, durability, and variety of format	✓		
Value commensurate with cost and/or need		✓	



<p>Resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as electronic and multimedia (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies).</p>	✓		
<p>Provide a global perspective and promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures.</p>	✓		

Additional Notes:

Library Book Selection Criteria
Review of: Push, by Sapphire

Please note any areas of concern for possible conversation. If the criteria is not applicable (from your perspective) note n/a

	No Concern	Concern	Comments
Alignment with District and State standards	X		
Contribution to the curriculum and educational goals	X		
Relevance to the varied interest of the students	X		
Favorable reviews found in standard selection sources	X		
Favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel	X		
Readability	X		
Reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher	X		
Validity, currency, and appropriateness of material	X		
Contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues	X		
High degree of potential user appeal	X		
Artistic quality and literacy style		X	- Could be not taken seriously due to the way the speaker is presented
Quality, durability, and variety of format	X		
Value commensurate with cost and/or need	X		



Resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as electronic and multimedia (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies).	X		
Provide a global perspective and promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures.	X		

Additional Notes:

-only change would be to have a trigger warning for incest, abuse, etc.



Library Book Selection Criteria

Review of: Push, by Sapphire

Please note any areas of concern for possible conversation. If the criteria is not applicable (from your perspective) note n/a

	No Concern	Concern	Comments
Alignment with District and State standards	X		
Contribution to the curriculum and educational goals	X		preference
Relevance to the varied interest of the students	X		
Favorable reviews found in standard selection sources	X		
Favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel			Reviews + Awards Books for Teen Age Reliable sources more - favorable review relevant to community - viewpoint
Readability		X	Difficult to follow Shows variety, ELL
Reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher	X		
Validity, currency, and appropriateness of material			provocative w/ graphic - words for impact, net w/ graphic
Contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues			successful underrepresented
High degree of potential user appeal			
Artistic quality and literacy style		X	progression tinger warning
Quality, durability, and variety of format	X		
Value commensurate with cost and/or need	X		

Return to circulation



LUCIA MAR
UNIFIED SCHOOL DISTRICT

Resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as electronic and multimedia (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies).	X		
Provide a global perspective and promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures.	X		

Additional Notes:



Library Book Selection Criteria

Review of: Push, by Sapphire

Please note any areas of concern for possible conversation. If the criteria is not applicable (from your perspective) note n/a

	No Concern	Concern	Comments
Alignment with District and State standards	X		
Contribution to the curriculum and educational goals	X		
Relevance to the varied interest of the students	X		
Favorable reviews found in standard selection sources	X		
Favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel	X		
Readability		X	Due to spelling it is difficult to read
Reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher	X		
Validity, currency, and appropriateness of material	X		
Contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues	X		
High degree of potential user appeal	X	X	I don't think most students would select this book
Artistic quality and literacy style	X		
Quality, durability, and variety of format	X		
Value commensurate with cost and/or need	X		



Resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as electronic and multimedia (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies).	X		
Provide a <u>global perspective</u> and <u>promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures.</u>	X		

Additional Notes:



Library Book Selection Criteria

Review of: Push, by Sapphire

Please note any areas of concern for possible conversation. If the criteria is not applicable (from your perspective) note n/a

	No Concern	Concern	Comments
Alignment with District and State standards	X		
Contribution to the curriculum and educational goals	X		
Relevance to the varied interest of the students	X		
Favorable reviews found in standard selection sources	X		
Favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel	X		- Made into award winning movie - NYT "Books for the Teen Age"
Readability	X		- can be difficult to read
Reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher	X		
Validity, currency, and appropriateness of material	X		- Words chosen to inform so not chosen to be "trigger" - Trigger warning?
Contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues	X		- 15th Amendment rights - what about Black joy - are there books that show positive Black stories?
High degree of potential user appeal	X		Hasn't been checked out? - HS representative representative said she enjoyed the book
Artistic quality and literacy style	X		
Quality, durability, and variety of format	X		
Value commensurate with cost and/or need	X		



<p>Resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as <u>electronic and multimedia</u> (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies).</p>	<p>✓</p>		
<p>Provide a global perspective and promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures.</p>	<p>✓</p>		

Additional Notes:

Library Book Selection Criteria
Review of: Push, by Sapphire

Please note any areas of concern for possible conversation. If the criteria is not applicable (from your perspective) note n/a

	No Concern	Concern	Comments
Alignment with District and State standards	✓		
Contribution to the curriculum and educational goals	✓		
Relevance to the varied interest of the students	✓		
Favorable reviews found in standard selection sources	✓		
Favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel		✓	Reviews / awards - Made into award winning motion picture
Readability	✓		Difficult to read + follow
Reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher	✓		
Validity, currency, and appropriateness of material	✓	✓	Pervasive vulgarity - - Words were chosen for impact not for the sake of vulgarity not
Contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues	✓		
High degree of potential user appeal	✓		
Artistic quality and literacy style	✓		Trigger warning
Quality, durability, and variety of format	✓		
Value commensurate with cost and/or need	✓		



Resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as electronic and multimedia (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies).	✓		
Provide a global perspective and promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures.	✓		

Additional Notes:

MUSTY *

- M** **Misleading** Can occur more rapidly in technology than mythology. Look for:
- “Dated” popular fiction
 - Obsolete information
 - Books containing racial, cultural or sexual stereotyping
- U** **Ugly** Refers to the physical condition of the book.
- Antiquated appearance
 - Worn-out, frayed, dirty
 - Unable to mend
- S** **Superseded** There may be newer copies available.
- Duplicate copies
 - Almanacs, yearbooks, encyclopedias superseded by newer editions
- T** **Trivial** Look for appropriateness for the collection. Check for poor writing, inaccurate information, an inappropriate interest or reading level for students.

Y **Your collection** has no use for the book. It is irrelevant to your curriculum.

* Coined by the American Library Association in cooperation with the Texas State Library, 1976

FOR FURTHER INFORMATION

The CREW Method; Expanded Guidelines for Collection Evaluation and Weeding for Small and Medium-Sized Public Libraries, Texas State Library, 1995

Weeding Library Collections, Stanley J. Slote, Libraries Unlimited, 1997

Where Do I Start? A School Library Handbook, Santa Clara County Office of Education, Linworth, 2000

California School Library Information
<http://www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/lb/index.asp>

Norfolk Public Schools, VA Library Media Center Handbook
http://www.npsk12.com/pdf/Media_Services_Handbook-2013-14.pdf
[Note: the preceding link is invalid.]

Sunlink Weed of the Month Club <http://tinyurl.com/kr53b5v> [Note: the preceding link is invalid.]



California Department of Education
Curriculum Frameworks and
Instructional Resources Division
www.cde.ca.gov/ci/cr/lb/index.asp
Office: 1430 N Street, Suite 3207
Sacramento, CA, 95814

WEEDING THE SCHOOL LIBRARY

The Counterpart to Selection



Why Weed?

It does not matter how many books you may have, but whether they are good or not.

— *Epistola*e Morale
Lucius Annaeus SENECA
3 B.C.-65 A.D

WEEDING THE COLLECTION

DEFINITION

Weeding is the removing of materials from a library collection in a systematic and deliberate way. It is an ongoing part of collection development, a planned and thoughtful action that will ensure library materials are current and enticing.

DEVELOP A WEEDING POLICY AND CRITERIA

A part of the district selection policy should include a plan for weeding the school library collection. This weeding policy should include a justification, rationale, a plan for teacher evaluation of materials being considered for discard and a process for disposal.

The following criteria should be considered in developing such a policy:

- **Copyright:** a clue to look more carefully at the content.
- **Content:** look for relevance to the needs and curriculum of the school.
- **Physical condition:** look for ease of repair. Is there sufficient time and staff to complete major repairs?
- **Number of circulations** including last circulation. If not circulated for 5-10 years determine why.
- **Superseded:** is there newer information available?

INFORMAL WEEDING

An ongoing process that often occurs as materials are checked-in or checked-out.

FORMAL WEEDING

A planned process that is not superseded by informal weeding. A rotation schedule can be established allowing for systematic weeding over time.

COPYRIGHT

These are **suggested** copyright markers to consider. Utilize other criteria as well as these guidelines.

Dewey Classifications

000	2-10 years	500	5-10 years
100	10 years	600	5-10 years
200	2-10 years	700	5-15 years
300	5-10 years	800	flexible
400	10 years	900	15 years

Biographies

flexible

Fiction

10 years

Encyclopedia

5-7 years

Reference:

evaluate on individual basis

Periodicals

5 years

Almanacs/Yearbooks

3 years in reference, 3 additional years in circulation

CONSIDER KEEPING

- Classics, award winners
- Local History
- Annuals & School Publications
- Titles on current reading lists
- Out of print titles that are still useful
- Biographical Sources

PROCEDURE

- Design a plan that includes a schedule and a goal for the weeding process.
- Schedule weeding during an uninterrupted time.
- Have post-its, carts and boxes available.
- Look at each book and apply your criteria.
- If pulling the book, note the reason and place on a cart for mending or in a box for disposal.
- Remove records from circulation system.



Regulation 6163.1: Library Media Centers

Original Adopted Date: 09/05/2023 | Last Revised Date: 11/14/2023 | Last Reviewed Date: 11/14/2023

Library Media Centers

Selection of Library Media Resources Library media resources may include but are not limited to: print and non-print materials such as library books, video recordings, sound recordings, ebooks, maps, kits, and realia.

OBJECTIVES

Library media resources are selected to:

- support, enrich, and assist in implementing the educational program
- serve the specific needs and interests of individual students
- include all levels of difficulty, providing for a wide range of abilities and learning styles
- offer a variety of formats, with diversity of appeal and presentation of differing points of view
- serve the breadth of the curriculum, including background materials to supplement classroom instruction
- assist students in making intelligent judgments in their daily lives

RESPONSIBILITY

The responsibility for recommending selections rests with the District Librarian who shall discharge this obligation consistent with the Board's adopted instructional materials selection criteria (BP 6161.1) and procedures. Recommendations from the school community, including other library personnel, faculty, parents, and students are encouraged and will be considered. Selected resources are subject to approval by the site administrator.

Selection Criteria

Staff members involved in the selection of library media resources shall use the following criteria as a guide:

- alignment with District and State standards
- contribution to the curriculum and educational goals
- relevance to the varied interests of the students
- favorable reviews found in standard selection sources
- favorable recommendations based on preview and examination of materials by professional personnel
- readability
- reputation and significance of the author, producer, and publisher
- validity, currency, and appropriateness of material
- contribution to the breadth and diversity of representative viewpoints on controversial issues
- high degree of potential user appeal
- artistic quality and literary style
- quality, durability, and variety of format
- value commensurate with cost and/or need

- resources in physical and virtual formats, including print and non-print such as electronic and multimedia (including subscription databases and other online products, e-books, and other forms of emerging technologies)
- provide a global perspective and promote diversity by including materials by authors and illustrators of all cultures

PROCEDURES

Recommendations for library media resources are made by the library media teacher at the Instructional Materials Center to the District Librarian. All selections are made with due regard to requests and suggestions from library technicians, library assistants, staff, students, and parents.

Reviews of proposed acquisitions will be sought in the literature of reputable professional organizations and other reviewing sources recognized for their objectivity and wide experience. The following lists and tools may be consulted, but resources are not limited to these listings.

Bibliographies, using the latest editions and supplements:

American Library Association lists bibliographies prepared by educational organizations

Current reviewing media, such as:

Booklist
Horn Book
School Library Journal
Tidal Wave

Donation materials shall be judged by the selection criteria and shall be accepted or rejected by those criteria.

Monetary donations are acceptable with the understanding on the part of the donor that the money will be given to the District and that resources will be purchased after being selected according to the District criteria for selection.

COLLECTION MAINTENANCE

Selection is an ongoing process which includes the removal of resources no longer appropriate, and the replacement of lost and worn resources still of educational value. The systematic process of removing materials is referred to as "weeding the collection" by the California Department of Education. Weeding is standard practice for all libraries. It is a way of ensuring that library collections are useful, up-to-date, appealing, and in good condition. It is also a way of increasing circulation. Studies show that libraries with attractive, vital collections have greater circulation than those with crowded shelves housing dated materials in poor condition, even though the latter may have larger numbers of resources.

When evaluating resources for possible "deselection," the following criteria should be taken into account:

- copyright date, with special attention to accuracy and currency
- content, especially with regard to relevancy to the curriculum and student needs
- physical condition, taking into consideration the possibility of mending or rebinding
- obsolescence, especially if the item has been superseded by a newer edition
- frequency of use, including number of check-outs and date of last circulation
- duplicates, taking into consideration possible needs of other libraries in the District Resources that have been identified as "weeds" need to be withdrawn from the collection by deleting the local holdings records and removing or destroying the site's barcodes. They may then be offered to other District Library Media Centers. Resources that are not relocated to another site should be stamped "discard" or "withdrawn." They may then be offered to staff and students as free materials. Unwanted items may be recycled, discarded, or given to charity.

INTRADISTRICT SHARING OF LIBRARY RESOURCES

Each Library Media Center in the District is considered part of a unified school library media system. All library personnel are guided by the educational objectives and policies of the District. All resources may be shared and may be made available upon request to other school Library Media Centers in the District.

Reconsideration of Library Resources

Guiding Principles

1. Freedom of inquiry is vital to education in a democracy. The District supports the principles of intellectual freedom inherent in the First Amendment of the Constitution and expressed in the Library Bill of Rights and The Students' Right to Read (copies attached).
2. The District supports the right to a redress of grievances inherent in the First Amendment. Any parent of a student within the District and/or any District staff member may raise an objection to library media resources used in that specific school's Library Media Center on the basis of appropriateness.
3. The procedure for submitting a formal objection is outlined below. This procedure is for the purpose of considering the opinions of those persons in the schools and the community who are not directly involved in the selection process.
4. No parent or guardian has the right to determine reading, viewing, or listening resources for students other than his or her own children/wards.
5. The major criterion for the final decision is the appropriateness of the material for its intended use.
6. A decision to sustain a challenge shall not be interpreted as a judgment of irresponsibility by the professionals involved in the original selection and/or use of the material. Personnel shall not be punished or have their employment affected by decisions reached by the review committee.
7. Access to challenged resources may be restricted during the reconsideration process.

Request for Informal Reconsideration

All expressions of concern to staff members or administrators, whether received by telephone, letter, or in personal conversation shall be reported to the supervising library media teacher and the site administrator.

The supervising library media teacher and/or site administrator shall contact the complainant to discuss the concern and attempt to resolve the issue informally by listening to the complaint, explaining the selection procedure, criteria, and qualifications of those persons selecting the library materials, and the intended use of the resource.

Request for Formal Reconsideration

If the complainant wishes to file a formal request for reconsideration challenge, he or she must attest that they have first read, viewed, or listened to the resource in its entirety. A copy of the District's "Library Media Centers" Board Policy #6163.1 and Administrative Regulations and a Request for Reconsideration of Library Media Resource Form shall be provided to the party concerned by the supervising library media teacher or site administrator.

1. Preliminary Procedures

- The Instructional Media Center ("IMC") and each school site will keep on hand and make available the Request for Reconsideration of Library Media Center Resource form. All formal objections to library media resources must be made on these forms.
- The complainant must read, view, or listen to the resource in its entirety before submitting a Request for Reconsideration of Library Media Center Resource form.
- At school sites, the Request for Reconsideration of Library Media Center Resource form shall be signed by the complainant and filed with the principal or designee. At the IMC, the form shall be filed with the Director of Curriculum or designee.

- The Assistant Superintendent of Curriculum shall be informed of any formal Request for Reconsideration received.
- The Request for Reconsideration shall be referred to a review committee at the school or IMC for reevaluation of the resource. This committee may involve additional personnel as appropriate.

2. The Review Committee

Upon receipt of a formal Request for Reconsideration, the Director of Curriculum or designee shall:

Appoint a reconsideration committee of seven members, including the following as appropriate:

- The District Librarian
- The library media technician
- One member of the district staff chosen by the Director of Curriculum or designee
- One member of the school teaching staff
- One member of the School Site Council or other community member
- At the secondary level, one or two representatives of the school's student government organization may be chosen by the site administrator to provide feedback to the committee.

Name a chair for the committee.

Make the resource available for reading, viewing, or listening by the committee.

Arrange for a meeting of the committee within fifteen working days after receipt of the formal Request for Reconsideration. This timeline may be extended by the committee chair for an additional 14 days as necessary so long as notice is provided to the complainant of the need for the extension.

3. Resolution

The committee shall review the resource in question and judge whether it conforms to the principles and criteria of selection outlined in the Selection of Library Media Resources procedure.

The review committee may choose to consult district support staff and/or community persons with related professional knowledge.

The chair shall notify the complainant and other appropriate persons of the meetings and invite them to attend.

A recorder shall be responsible for keeping records of the meeting(s) and filing required reports.

The review committee shall:

- Bear in mind the principles of the freedom to learn and read
- Examine the challenged resource
- Provide an opportunity for appropriate persons to address the committee, including the individuals(s) expressing the concern and staff using the resource
- Determine general acceptance of the resource by consulting standard evaluation aids and local holdings in other schools
- Weigh values and faults and form opinions based on the material as a whole rather than on passages or sections taken out of context
- Discuss the challenged resource in the context of the educational program

- Reach a decision about the continued use of the resource and prepare a written report
- A challenge to a title may result in access to it being retained, restricted, or withdrawn entirely. Restrictions on access may include relocating the book to a section of the library intended for an older age group than the book is intended for, labeling it with a content warning or rating, taking it out of the online catalog so it has to be requested from a staff member, removing it from open and freely browsable stacks, or requiring parental permission to check it out.

The written report shall be retained by the site administrator, with copies forwarded to the Director of Instructional Services and the Assistant Superintendent of Educational Services.

The decision of the review committee shall be final.
