

**E-Rate Response Evaluations for FY2022 - 2023
USAC Form 470 and DeKalb County School District
(DCSD) Requirements**

Executive Summary and Supporting Document

E-Rate Project Team:

Natalie Terrell, PMO Manager

Jimmy Crum, Network Services Manager

Manager William Clowers, Sr. Project Manager

Cedric Brown, System Engineer

Consulting Team: Educational Funding Group, Inc. (EFG)

TABLE OF CONTENT

Executive Summary..... Page 3

Supporting Documents

 Appendix I Evaluation Team’s Credentials..... Page 4

 Appendix II: Evaluation Summaries..... Page 5

 Category 2: Wireless Access Points (APs) Page 5 - 6

 Category 2: Internal Connections..... Page 7

 Category 1: SPF Maintenance..... Page 8

 Category 2: Stadiums Fiber.....Page 9

E-Rate Response Evaluations for FY2022 – 2023
USAC Form 470 and DeKalb County School District (DCSD) Requirements
Executive Summary

Purpose

The purpose of this evaluation is to request funding from Universal Service Administrative Company (USAC), which manages the contribution of revenue to and distribution of E-Rate funding from the Universal Service Fund. The funding is provided for broadband, Internet access, and internal connections to eligible schools and libraries. DeKalb County School District (DCSD) is eligible for these services. Funding is being requested in two categories:

- Category 1 (includes services needed to support broadband connectivity to schools and libraries) - The district has requested: Self-Provisioned Fiber Maintenance
- Category 2 (includes the internal connections needed for broadband connectivity) - The district has requested: Internal Connections (Cabling) and Wireless Access Points (APs)

Background and Process

The evaluation team was made up of five (5) district staff members in the Division of Information and Instructional Technology (DIIT). A (brief) summary of each team member's IT experience and education is in Appendix I, p.4. Form 470, which is the form published by USAC of the district's requirements for each solicitation. The form was written by the district E-Rate consulting team and approved by IT's management staff. It was published on February 17 for 28 days as required by USAC. Evaluations began on Friday, March 18 and completed on Monday, March 21 to meet USAC deadlines for March 22. There were 18 responses for 5 different solicitations in the two categories in the Form 470 requirements. The team reviewed 18 of the 18 responses in 2 days (for 6 hours). Due to the immediate needs of the district, the team made recommendations for 4 of the 16 solicitations for the funding year 2022 - 2023.

Evaluation Results

See the results in the evaluation table in Appendix II, pp. 6 - 14.

Appendix I: Evaluation Team's Credentials

1. Natalie Terrell, IT PMO Manager III
 - a. Role: Evaluation Facilitator – Led the RFP process for most of the IT RFPs for the last 7 years
 - b. Years in IT: 27 Years (technology teacher, trainer, project manager, and IT PMO Manager) with 21 years in DCSD IT and 15 years in the IT PMO
 - c. Education: BBA in Management and MS in Education in Instructional Technology, PMP Certified
2. Jimmy Crum, Information Security Officer
 - a. Role: Team Member – Two years of experience at DCSD evaluating solicitations
 - b. Years in IT: 17.5 years with 2.5 years in DCSD IT with 10 Years as Senior Internet Engineer and 5 Years as Program Director Cybersecurity/Cybersecurity
 - c. Education: MS in Computer Science and CCSENT (Cisco networking) Certified
3. William Clowers, IT Project Manager
 - a. Role: Team Member and Project Manager of all E-Rate Projects
 - b. Years in IT: 31 years with 13 years in DCSD IT PMO
 - c. Education: BEE in Electrical Engineering and Executive MBA, PMP
4. Cedric Brown, Wireless Network Engineer
 - a. Role: Team Member – Secure wireless technologies, internet service operations and managed wi-Fi product development
 - b. Years in IY: 21.5 years as Sr. Director and above within the Internet Service Provider Industry
 - c. Education: BS Dual Degree in Mathematics and Computer Science
5. Educational Funding Group, Inc. (EFG)

This organization was formed in 2004 in Cleveland, Ohio. EFG provides full-service E-rate consulting services to its clients offering comprehensive, personalized services designed to maximize the benefits received from the E-rate program.

 - i. Paul Karas - Founder and President of EFG, has been an E-rate consultant since the inception of the E-rate program and provides high-level solution-based support, as well as extensive technical expertise.
 - ii. Courtney Cikach – Has served as the district's account manager for the past seven years and tends diligently to all the District's E-rate needs.

Appendix II: Evaluation Summaries

VENDOR DECISION/EVALUATION MATRIX				
SCHOOL OR LIBRARY NAME: DeKalb Co. SD		Date: March 18 and 22, 2022		E-rate: 2022-23
			Choose and indicate the service (1 per Matrix):	Int. Connections or MIBS or Basic Maintenance:
Eligible Service:		CATEGORY 2:	→'→'→'→'→'→	Internal Connections (APs)
				SERVICE PROVIDERS
Factors	Total Points Available	VENDOR 1	VENDOR 2	VENDOR 3
		ICN	PCS	Layer 3
		\$3,700,920.00	\$2,784,000.00	\$3,729,571.80
Price	30	25	30	25
Past Experience / Relationship with Respondent	20	20	10	20
Technical Capability, Quality of Work, Ability to Provide Services Purchased / Turnkey Solution, Qualified Personnel	25	25	25	25
Comparable Work for Other Applicants	10	10	10	10
Changeover Costs	10	10	0	10
Willingness to invoice via SPI	5	5		5

TOTAL POINTS:	100	95	75	95
Winning bidder based on most points was: ICN				
NOTES:				
PCS - We will not consider the Extreme; it may be cheaper, the district already has licenses for 6400 devices already installed; All new licenses and infrastructure, training, and operational tools would be required. the cost of these items is prohibited.				

VENDOR DECISION/EVALUATION MATRIX															
SCHOOL OR LIBRARY NAME: DeKalb Co. SD			Date: March 18 - 22, 2022									E-rate: 2022-23			
Eligible Service:	SELF-PROVISIONED NETWORK, including maintenance (MUST ALSO BID LIT AND DARK FIBER ON THE SAME 470 AND PROVE COST-EFFECTIVENESS OF YOUR DECISION OVER THE TIME PERIOD OF YOUR CONTRACT.														
Factors	Total Points Available	Lit Fiber Vendor 1	IA/DTS Vendor 1	IA/DTS Vendor 2	IA/DTS Vendor 3	IA/DTS Vendor 5	IA Only Vendor 1	IA Only Vendor 2	IA/Dark Fiber 56 Marietta to AIC	IA/Dark Fiber 56 Marietta to AIC	Dark Fiber Vendor 1	Cost of Equip	Cost of Maint		
		Zayo	Zayo	ENA	AT&T	Proficient	Zayo	Cogent	Zayo/Zayo	Cogent/Zayo	Zayo	Layer 3	N/A		
Total Price (MRC)		\$2,725	\$6,578	\$16,400	\$12,139.37	\$16,467.00	\$4,104	\$8,130.00	\$6,704.00	\$10,730.00	\$2,600	\$10,884.49 (Per Location NRC)	N/A		
NOTE: Eligible costs include monthly charges, special construction, installation and activation, modulating electronics and other necessary equipment to make the broadband service functional.							\$6,829	\$10,855							
Bids are necessary for equipment, services, maintenance and operation. Remember to consider the number of years your contract extends so that you can prove the most cost-effective solution.															
Price	25		25	15	20	10	20	15	24	22					
Experience with vendor	20		20	20	20	0	20	20	20	20					
Technical Capability & Quality of work for other districts	20		20	20	20	10	20	20	20	20					
Ability of vendor to provide a complete solution	15		15	15	15	7	15	15	15	15					
Quality of Personnel	10		10	10	10	5	10	10	10	10					
Responsiveness	10		10	10	10	0	10	10	10	10					
TOTAL POINTS:	100		100	90	95	32	95	90	99	97					
Winning bidder based on most points was: Zayo															
NOTES:															
1) Cost for Column H = Column C + Column H															
2) Cost for Column I = Column C + Column I															
3) Cost for Column J = Column H + Column L															
4) Cost for Column K = Column I + Column L															

VENDOR DECISION/EVALUATION MATRIX			
SCHOOL OR LIBRARY NAME: DeKalb Co. SD			E-rate: 2022-23
Eligible Service:	Self-Provisioned Network Maintenance		
Factors	Total Points Available	Vendor 1	
Zayo			
Price	30	30	
Experience	25	25	
Product/ Service Features	20	20	
Reliability	20	20	
Local Preference	5	5	
TOTAL POINTS:	100	100	
The winning bidder based on the most points was: Zayo			
NOTES:			
1) multi-year relationship			
2) one-respondent, the incumbent			

BID EVALUATION MATRIX
Dekalb CSD Self-Provisioned Fiber 60 months
03/22/22
E-Rate Funding Year 2022
Eligible Service: Data Transmission Service

Halford Stadium

Factors	Total Points Available	Zayo (SP Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo (DF Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo lit fiber
Price	30	30	30	25
Responsiveness	20	20	20	20
Reliability	25	25	25	25
Past Experience	25	25	25	25
TOTAL POINTS:	100	100	100	95
Pricing: Monthly		\$14,160.00	\$14,160.00	\$42,000.00
NRC		\$116,806.68	\$116,806.68	\$116,806.68
Total Fiber		\$130,966.68	\$130,966.68	\$158,806.68
Total Electronics - Layer 3		\$21,768.98	\$21,768.98	\$0.00
Project Total		\$152,735.66	\$152,735.66	\$158,806.68

The winning bidder based on most points was:

SF

Selection team member initials:

Disqualified bidders, if any:

Notes:

Adams Stadium

Factors	Total Points Available	Zayo (SP Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo (DF Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo lit fiber
Price	30	30	30	25
Responsiveness	20	20	20	20
Reliability	25	25	25	25
Past Experience	25	25	25	25

TOTAL POINTS:	100	100	100	95
Pricing: Monthly		\$14,160.00	\$14,160.00	\$42,000.00
NRC		\$29,199.96	\$29,199.96	\$29,199.96
Total Fiber		\$43,359.96	\$43,359.96	\$71,199.96
Total Electronics - Layer 3		\$21,768.98	\$21,768.98	\$0.00
Project Total		\$65,128.94	\$65,128.94	\$71,199.96

The winning bidder based on most points was:

SF

Selection team member initials:

Disqualified bidders, if any:

Notes:

Godfrey Stadium

Factors	Total Points Available	Zayo (SP Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo (DF Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo lit fiber
Price	30	30	30	25
Responsiveness	20	20	20	20
Reliability	25	25	25	25
Past Experience	25	25	25	25
TOTAL POINTS:	100	100	100	95

Pricing: Monthly		\$14,160.00	\$14,160.00	\$42,000.00
NRC		\$33,641.88	\$33,641.88	\$33,641.88
Total Fiber		\$47,801.88	\$47,801.88	\$75,641.88
Total Electronics - Layer 3		\$21,768.98	\$21,768.98	\$0.00
Project Total		\$69,570.86	\$69,570.86	\$75,641.88

The winning bidder based on most points was:

SF

Selection team member initials:

Disqualified bidders, if any:

Notes:

Avondale Stadium

Factors	Total Points Available	Zayo (SP Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo (DF Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo lit fiber
Price	30	30	30	25
Responsiveness	20	20	20	20
Reliability	25	25	25	25
Past Experience	25	25	25	25
TOTAL POINTS:	100	100	100	95

Pricing: Monthly		\$14,160.00	\$14,160.00	\$42,000.00
NRC		\$63,522.45	\$63,522.45	\$63,522.45
Total Fiber		\$77,682.45	\$77,682.45	\$105,522.45
Total Electronics - Layer 3		\$21,768.98	\$21,768.98	\$0.00
Project Total		\$99,451.43	\$99,451.43	\$105,522.45

The winning bidder based on most points was:

SF

Selection team member initials:

Disqualified bidders, if any:

Notes:

North Dekalb Stadium

Factors	Total Points Available	Zayo (SP Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo (DF Fiber) 2, 4, or 6 strand	Zayo lit fiber
Price	30	30	30	25
Responsiveness	20	20	20	20
Reliability	25	25	25	25
Past Experience	25	25	25	25
TOTAL POINTS:	100	100	100	95

Pricing: Monthly		\$14,160.00	\$14,160.00	\$42,000.00
------------------	--	-------------	-------------	-------------

NRC	\$63,620.09	\$63,620.09	\$63,620.09
Total Fiber	\$77,780.09	\$77,780.09	\$105,620.09
Total Electronics - Layer 3	\$21,768.98	\$21,768.98	\$0.00
Project Total	\$99,549.07	\$99,549.07	\$105,620.09

The winning bidder based on most points was:

SF

Selection team member initials:

Disqualified bidders, if any:

Notes: